

In The
Supreme Court of the United States
October Term, 2005

BUCKEYE CHECK CASHING, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

JOHN CARDEGNA, et al.,
Respondents.

On Petition For Writ of Certiorari To the
Florida Supreme Court

BRIEF OF FLORIDA, ALASKA, ARIZONA, ARKANSAS,
CALIFORNIA, COLORADO, CONNECTICUT, DELAWARE,
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, GEORGIA, HAWAII, IDAHO,
ILLINOIS, INDIANA, IOWA, KENTUCKY, MAINE,
MARYLAND, MASSACHUSETTS, MINNESOTA, MISSISSIPPI,
MISSOURI, MONTANA, NEVADA, NEW HAMPSHIRE, NEW
MEXICO, NEW YORK, NORTH CAROLINA, NORTH
DAKOTA, OHIO, OREGON, PENNSYLVANIA, PUERTO RICO,
RHODE ISLAND, SOUTH DAKOTA, TENNESSEE, TEXAS,
UTAH, WASHINGTON, WEST VIRGINIA, WISCONSIN, AND
WYOMING AS *AMICI CURIAE* IN SUPPORT OF
RESPONDENTS

CHARLES J. CRIST, JR.
Attorney General of Florida

CHRISTOPHER M. KISE
Solicitor General
Counsel of Record

ERIK M. FIGLIO
Deputy Solicitor General
Office of the Attorney General
PL-01, The Capitol
Tallahassee, FL 32399
(850) 414-3300
Counsel for Amici Curiae

David W. Marquez
Attorney General of Alaska
P. O. Box 110300
Juneau, AK 99801-0300

Terry Goddard
Attorney General of Arizona
Office of the Attorney General
1275 West Washington Street
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Mike Beebe
Attorney General of Arkansas
Office of the Attorney General
323 Center Street, Suite 200
Little Rock, AR 72201-2610

Bill Lockyer
Attorney General of California
Office of the Attorney General
1300 I Street, Suite 1740
Sacramento, CA 95814

John Suthers
Attorney General of Colorado
Office of the Attorney General
Department of Law
1525 Sherman Street
Denver, CO 80203

Richard Blumenthal
Attorney General of Connecticut
Office of the Attorney General
55 Elm Street
Hartford, CT 06141-0120

M. Jane Brady
Attorney General of Delaware
Office of the Attorney General
820 North French Street
Wilmington, DE 19801

Robert Spagnoletti
Attorney General of the District
of Columbia
Office of the Attorney General
441 4th Street NW
Washington, DC 20001

Thurbert E. Baker
Attorney General of Georgia
Office of the Attorney General
40 Capitol Square, S.W.
Atlanta, GA 30334-1300

Mark J. Bennett
Attorney General of Hawaii
Office of the Attorney General
425 Queen Street
Honolulu, HI 96813

Lawrence Wasden
Attorney General of Idaho
Office of the Attorney General
Statehouse
Boise, ID 83720-1000

Lisa Madigan
Attorney General of Illinois
Office of the Attorney General
James R. Thompson Center
100 West Randolph Street
Chicago, IL 60601

Steve Carter
Attorney General of Indiana
Office of the Attorney General
302 West Washington Street
Indianapolis, IN 46204

Tom Miller
Attorney General of Iowa
Office of the Attorney General
1305 East Walnut
Des Moines, IA 50319

Gregory D. Stumbo
Attorney General of Kentucky
Office of the Attorney General
State Capitol, Room 116
Frankfort, KY 40601

Steve Rowe
Attorney General of Maine
Office of the Attorney General
State House Station Six
Augusta, ME 04333

J. Joseph Curran, Jr.
Attorney General of Maryland
200 St. Paul Place
Baltimore, MD 21202

Tom Reilly
Attorney General of
Massachusetts
Office of the Attorney General
One Ashburton Place
Boston, MA 02108-1698

Mike Hatch
Attorney General of Minnesota
Office of the Attorney General
State Capitol, Suite 102
St. Paul, MN 55155

Jim Hood
Attorney General of Mississippi
Office of the Attorney General
Department of Justice
Post Office Box 220
Jackson, MS 39205-0220

Jeremiah W. (Jay) Nixon
Attorney General of Missouri
207 West High Street
Jefferson City, MO 65101

Mike McGrath
Attorney General of Montana
P. O. Box 201401
Helena, MT 59620-1401

Brian Sandoval
Attorney General of Nevada
Office of the Attorney General
100 North Carson Street
Carson City, NV 89701

Kelly Ayotte
Attorney General of New
Hampshire
Office of the Attorney General
33 Capitol Street
Concord, NH 03301-6397

Patricia Madrid
Attorney General of New Mexico
Office of the Attorney General
Post Office Drawer 1508
Santa Fe, NM 87504-1508

Eliot Spitzer
Attorney General of New York
Office of the Attorney General
120 Broadway
Albany, NY 12224

Roy Cooper
Attorney General of North
Carolina
Office of the Attorney General
Post Office Box 629
Raleigh, NC 27602-0629

Wayne Stenehjem
Attorney General of North
Dakota
Office of the Attorney General
600 East Boulevard Avenue
Bismarck, ND 58505-0040

Jim Petro
Attorney General of Ohio
Office of the Attorney General
150 East Gay Street, 23rd Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

Hardy Myers
Attorney General of Oregon
Office of the Attorney General
Justice Building
1162 Court Street NE
Salem, OR 97301

Tom Corbett
Attorney General of
Pennsylvania
Office of the Attorney General
Strawberry Square
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Roberto J. Sanchez-Ramos
Secretary of Justice
Commonwealth of Puerto Rico
Post Office Box 192
San Juan, PR 00902-0192

Patrick Lynch
Attorney General of Rhode
Island
Office of the Attorney General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903

Larry Long
Attorney General of South
Dakota
Office of the Attorney General
500 East Capitol
Pierre, SD 57501-5070

Paul Summers
Attorney General of Tennessee
P. O. Box 20207
Nashville, TN 37202-0207

Greg Abbott
Attorney General of Texas
Office of the Attorney General
Post Office Box 12548
Austin, TX 78711-2548

Mark L. Shurtleff
Utah Attorney General
Utah State Capitol Complex
East Office Bldg., Suite 320
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320

Rob McKenna
Attorney General of Washington
1125 Washington Street
P. O. Box 40100
Olympia, WA 98504-0100

Darrell V. McGraw Jr.
Attorney General of West
Virginia
Office of the Attorney General
1900 Kanawha Boulevard East
Charleston, WV 25305

Peggy A. Lautenschlager
Attorney General of Wisconsin
Office of the Attorney General
Post Office Box 7857
Suite 114 East
Madison, WI 53707-7857

Patrick J. Crank
Attorney General of Wyoming
Office of the Attorney General
State Capitol Building
Cheyenne, WY 82002

QUESTION PRESENTED (RESTATED)

Whether the Federal Arbitration Act compels a State to enforce an arbitration clause embedded in an agreement that is criminally illegal under the laws of the State in which it was entered, in direct contravention of that State's established public policy.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	i
INTEREST OF <i>AMICI CURIAE</i>	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	2
ARGUMENT	4
I. <i>Southland</i> should be overruled	4
a. <i>Southland</i> is irreconcilable with the otherwise well-settled “clear statement” rule	4
b. Congress never intended for the FAA to conscript state judicial proceedings	12
c. <i>Stare decisis</i> is not a sufficient justification for retaining <i>Southland</i> in light of its dramatic impact on State sovereignty	15
II. <i>Prima Paint</i> does not compel enforcement of arbitration clauses embedded in criminally illegal agreements	21
a. <i>Prima Paint</i> does not mandate separability of arbitration clauses under all circumstances	21
b. The <i>Prima Paint</i> separability rule applies only in federal court proceedings	25
CONCLUSION	27

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

<i>Agostini v. Felton</i> , 521 U.S. 203 (1997).....	15
<i>Allied-Bruce Terminix Cos., Inc. v. Dobson</i> , 513 U.S. 263 (1995)	5, 19
<i>Atascadero State Hosp. v. Scanlon</i> , 473 U.S. 234 (1985)	4
<i>Bronson v. Kinzie</i> , 42 U.S. 311 (1843).....	13
<i>Bull HN Info. Sys. v. Hutson</i> , 229 F.3d 321 (1st Cir. 2000).....	18
<i>Camps Newfound/Owatonna v. Town of Harrison</i> , 520 U.S. 564 (1997)	6
<i>Cardegna v. Buckeye Check Cashing, Inc.</i> , 894 So. 2d 860 (Fla. 2005)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Chandler v. Kendrick</i> , 146 So. 551 (Fla. 1933)	18, 25
<i>Circuit City Stores v. Adams</i> , 532 U.S. 105 (2001)	5
<i>Doctor's Assocs. v. Casarotto</i> , 517 U.S. 681 (1996)	19
<i>El Dorado Sch. District #15 v. Continental Cas. Co.</i> , 247 F.3d 843 (8th Cir. 2001).....	17
<i>Federated Dep't Stores v. J.V.B. Indus.</i> , 894 F.2d 862 (6th Cir. 1990).....	18
<i>Florida Lime & Avocado Growers, Inc. v. Paul</i> , 373 U.S. 132 (1963)	4

<i>Geneva Sec., Inc. v. Johnson</i> , 138 F.3d 688 (7th Cir. 1998).....	17
<i>Gingiss Int'l v. Bormet</i> , 58 F.3d 328 (7th Cir. 1995)	18
<i>Green Tree Fin. Corp. v. Bazzle</i> , 539 U.S. 444 (2003).....	7, 21
<i>Gregory v. Ashcroft</i> , 501 U.S. 452 (1991)	4
<i>Hardware Dealers Mut. Fire Ins. Co. v. Glidden Co.</i> , 284 U.S. 151 (1931)	13
<i>Howlett v. Rose</i> , 496 U.S. 356 (1990).....	13
<i>Ingersoll-Rand Co. v. McClendon</i> , 498 U.S. 133 (1990)	12
<i>Jersey Palm-Gross v. Paper</i> , 658 So. 2d 531 (Fla. 1995).....	18, 25
<i>Johnson v. Fankell</i> , 520 U.S. 911 (1997).....	13
<i>KFC Nat'l Mgmt. Co. v. Beauregard</i> , 739 So. 2d 630 (Fla. 5th DCA 1999).....	11
<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i> , 539 U.S. 558 (2003)	15
<i>MCI Telecomms. Corp. v. Matrix Communs. Corp.</i> , 135 F.3d 27 (1st Cir. 1998)	17
<i>Mitsubishi Motors Corp. v. Soler Chrysler-Plymouth, Inc.</i> , 473 U.S. 614 (1985)	17, 27
<i>New State Ice Co. v. Liebmann</i> , 285 U.S. 262 (1932).....	20
<i>New York v. United States</i> , 505 U.S. 144 (1992)	14

<i>Orkin Exterminating Co. v. Petsch</i> , 872 So. 2d 259 (Fla. 2d DCA 2004).....	11
<i>O.R. Sec., Inc. v. Professional Planning Assocs., Inc.</i> , 857 F.2d 742 (11th Cir. 1988).....	17
<i>Oubre v. Entergy Operations</i> , 522 U.S. 422 (1998).....	23
<i>Party Yards, Inc. v. Templeton</i> , 751 So. 2d 121 (Fla. 5th DCA 2000).....	16
<i>Payne v. Tenn.</i> , 501 U.S. 808 (1991)	15
<i>Pennsylvania Dep't of Corr. v. Yeskey</i> , 524 U.S. 206 (1998)	23
<i>Perry v. Thomas</i> , 482 U.S. 483 (1987).....	5, 19, 22
<i>Prima Paint Corp. v. Flood & Conklin Mfg. Co.</i> , 388 U.S. 395 (1967)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Printz v. United States</i> , 521 U.S. 898 (1997)	14
<i>Raygor v. Regents of the Univ. of Minn.</i> , 534 U.S. 533 (2002)	4
<i>Red Cross Line v. Atlantic Fruit Co.</i> , 264 U.S. 109 (1924)	10, 11
<i>Rice v. Santa Fe Elevator Corp.</i> , 331 U.S. 218 (1947).....	4
<i>Rodriguez de Quijas v. Shearson/American Express, Inc.</i> , 490 U.S. 477 (1989)	17, 19
<i>Seminole Tribe v. Florida</i> , 517 U.S. 44 (1996).....	15

<i>Shearson/American Express v. McMahon</i> , 482 U.S. 220 (1987)	19
<i>Southland Corp. v. Keating</i> , 465 U.S. 1 (1984)	<i>passim</i>
<i>State Oil Co. v. Khan</i> , 522 U.S. 3 (1997)	15
<i>Testa v. Katt</i> , 330 U.S. 386 (1947)	14
<i>United States v. Lopez</i> , 514 U.S. 549 (1995)	20
<i>Vermont Agency of Natural Res. v. United States ex rel. Stevens</i> , 529 U.S. 765 (2000)	4
<i>Volt Info. Sciences, Inc. v. Board of Trs. of Leland</i> , 489 U. S. 468 (1989)	26
<i>Wilko v. Swan</i> , 346 U.S. 427 (1953)	17
<i>Will v. Michigan Dep't of State Police</i> , 491 U.S. 58 (1989)	4

CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS

U.S. Const., art. VI, cl. 2	4
-----------------------------------	---

FEDERAL STATUTES

9 U.S.C. § 2	3, 21
9 U.S.C. § 3	25
9 U.S.C. § 4	23, 26
9 U.S.C. § 10	17

28 U.S.C. § 451	25
28 U.S.C. § 1331	14

OTHER CONGRESSIONAL MATERIALS

H.R. Rep. No. 68-96 (1924)	8
<i>Joint Hearings on S. 1005 and H.R. 646 and Subcommittees of the Committees on the Judiciary, 68th Cong. 40 (1924)</i>	1, 10
S. Rep. No. 68-536 (1924)	11

STATE STATUTES

Alaska Stat. §§ 09.43.10 to -.480	19
Ariz. Rev. Stat. Ann. §§ 12-1501 to 1518	19
Ark. Code Ann. §§ 16-108-201 to -224	19
Cal. Civ. Proc. Code §§ 1280 to 1294.2	19
Colo. Rev. Stat. §§ 13-22-201 to -223	19
Conn. Gen. Stat. §§ 52-408 to -424	19
Del Code Ann. tit. 10, §§ 5701 to 5725	19
Fla. Stat. § 682.02	19
Fla. Stat. § 687.071	19
O.C.G.A. §§ 9-1-1 to -18	19

Haw. Rev. Stat. §§ 658A-1 to -29	19
Idaho Code §§ 7-901 to -922.....	19
710 Ill. Comp. Stat. Ch. 5/1 to -23	19
Ind. Code. Ann. §§ 34-57-2-1	19
Iowa Code Ann. §§ 679A.1 to -.19	19
Kan. Stat. Ann. 5-401 to -422	19
Ky. Rev. Stat. Ann. §§ 417.045 to -.240	19
La. Rev. Stat. Ann. § 9:4201 to -:4217.....	19
Mass. Gen. Laws Ann. Ch. 251, §§ 1 to 19.....	19
Md. Code Ann., Cts. & Jud. Proc. §§ 3-201 to -234.....	19
Me. Rev. Stat. Ann. tit. 14, §§ 5927 to 5949.....	19
Mich. Comp. Laws Ann. §§ 600.5001 to -.5035.....	19
Minn. Stat. Ann. §§ 572.08 to -.30.....	19
Mo. Rev. Stat. §§ 435.350 to .470.....	19
Mont. Code Ann. §§ 27-5-111 to -324.....	19
N.C. Gen. Stat. §§ 1-567.1 to -.31.....	19
N.D. Cent. Code §§ 32-29.2-01 to -29.....	19
N.H. Rev. Stat. Ann. §§ 542:1 to -:11	19

