
In The
Supreme Court of the United States

BUCKEYE CHECK CASHING, INC.,

Petitioner,

v.

JOHN A. CARDEGNA AND DONNA REUTER,

Respondents.

**On Writ Of Certiorari To The
Supreme Court Of Florida**

**BRIEF OF AMICUS CURIAE SAMUEL GLAZER
IN SUPPORT OF RESPONDENTS**

KENNETH D. SCHWARTZ, *Counsel of Record*
ROBERT P. DUVIN
EMILY C. FIFTAL

DUVIN, CAHN & HUTTON
Erievew Tower, 20th Floor
1301 East Ninth Street
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
Telephone: (216) 696-7600
Facsimile: (216) 696-2038
kschwartz@duvin.com
rduvin@duvin.com
efiftal@duvin.com

Counsel for Amicus Curiae

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	ii
INTEREST OF AMICUS CURIAE.....	1
CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY PROVISIONS INVOLVED.....	5
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT.....	7
ARGUMENT.....	9
I. <i>PRIMA PAINTS</i> ’ “SEPARABILITY” RA- TIONALE IS BASED ON A STATUTORY DEFAULT RULE OF IMPLIED CONSENT THAT SHOULD NOT BE EXTENDED TO CLAIMS THAT AN UNDERLYING CON- TRACT CONTAINING AN ARBITRATION PROVISION NEVER EXISTED	10
A. The <i>Prima Paint</i> Decision.....	10
B. Courts’ Broad Extension of <i>Prima Paint</i>	11
II. <i>FIRST OPTIONS</i> REQUIRES THAT COURTS RESOLVE A CLAIM THAT NO UNDERLY- ING CONTRACT EXISTS, UNLESS THE PARTIES CLEARLY AND UNMISTAKABLY EVIDENCE THEIR ACTUAL CONSENT TO SEND SUCH A CLAIM TO ARBITRATION ...	16
CONCLUSION.....	22

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page
CASES	
<i>Allied-Bruce Terminex Cos. v. Dobson</i> , 513 U.S. 265 (1995).....	10, 21
<i>Burden v. Check Into Cash</i> , 267 F.3d 483 (6th Cir. 2001), <i>cert. denied</i> , 535 U.S. 970 (2002).....	12, 13
<i>CBS Employees Fed. Credit Union v. Donaldson, Lufkin and Jenrette Secs. Corp.</i> , 912 F.2d 1563 (6th Cir. 1990).....	12
<i>Commonwealth Coatings Corp. v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 393 U.S. 145 (1968).....	18
<i>Connally v. Georgia</i> , 429 U.S. 245 (1977).....	18
<i>Fazio, et al. v. Lehman Bros., Inc., et al.</i> , 268 F. Supp. 2d 865 (N.D. Ohio 2002).....	3
<i>Fazio, et al. v. Lehman Bros., Inc., et al.</i> , 340 F.3d 386 (6th Cir. 2003).....	4, 12
<i>First Options of Chi., Inc. v. Kaplan</i> , 514 U.S. 938 (1995).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Gibson v. Berryhill</i> , 411 U.S. 564 (1973).....	18
<i>Glazer v. Lehman Bros., Inc., et al.</i> , No. 1:02 CV 370 (N.D. Ohio Oct. 3, 2003).....	4
<i>Glazer v. Lehman Bros., Inc., et al.</i> , 394 F.3d 444 (6th Cir. 2005).....	4
<i>Granfinanciera, S.A. v. Nordberg</i> , 492 U.S. 33 (1989).....	22
<i>Jenkins v. First Am. Cash Advance</i> , 400 F.3d 868 (11th Cir. 2005).....	13
<i>Langley v. FDIC</i> , 484 U.S. 86 (1987).....	14

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES – Continued

	Page
<i>Prima Paint Corp. v. Flood & Conklin Mfg. Co.</i> , 388 U.S. 395 (1967)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Sandvik AB v. Advent Int'l Corp.</i> , 220 F.3d 99 (3d Cir. 2000)	14, 15
<i>Snowden v. Checkpoint Check Cashing</i> , 290 F.3d 631 (4th Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 537 U.S. 1087 (2002)	13
<i>Sphere Drake Ins. Ltd. v. All Am. Ins. Co.</i> , 256 F.3d 587 (7th Cir. 2001)	14, 22
<i>Sphere Drake Ins. Ltd. v. Clarendon Nat'l Ins. Co.</i> , 263 F.3d 26 (2d Cir. 2001)	14, 15
<i>Will Drill Res., Inc. v. Samson Res. Co.</i> , 352 F.3d 211 (5th Cir. 2001)	13

CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY PROVISIONS

Federal Arbitration Act, 9 U.S.C. §§ 1 <i>et seq.</i>	3, 6, 7, 10
United States Constitution amend. V	5, 22
United States Constitution amend. VII	5, 6, 22
United States Constitution amend. XIV, § 1	6, 22
United States Constitution art. III, § 1, 2	5

OTHER AUTHORITIES

<i>Arbitration of Interstate Commercial Disputes:</i> <i>Joint Hearings on S. 1005 and H.R. 646 Before</i> <i>the Subcomms. of the Comms. on the Judiciary,</i> <i>68th Cong. (1924)</i>	<i>20, 21</i>
Caniglia, John & Theis, Sandy, <i>How County Got \$9</i> <i>Million</i> , <i>The Cleveland Plain Dealer</i> , Jan. 8, 2004, at A1	1

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES – Continued

	Page
Cohen, Julius Henry & Dayton, Kenneth, <i>The New Federal Arbitration Law</i> , 12 Va. L. Rev. 265, 279 (1926).....	20
H.R. Rep. No. 96 (1924).....	20
Lehman Bros., Inc., Exchange Act Release No. 48336, 80 SEC Docket 2512-39 (Aug. 14, 2003) (\$2.5 million fine), <i>available at</i> http://www.sec.gov/litigation/admin/34-48335.htm	1
SG Cowen Secs. Corp., Exchange Act Release No. 48335, 80 SEC Docket 2501-38 (Aug. 14, 2003) (\$5 million fine), <i>available at</i> http://www.sec.gov/litigation/admin/34-48336.htm	1

