

IN THE
Supreme Court of the United States

BUCKEYE CHECK CASHING, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

JOHN CARDEGNA, *et al.*,
Respondents.

**On Writ of Certiorari to the
Supreme Court of Florida**

**BRIEF AMICI CURIAE
OF THE NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
CONSUMER ADVOCATES, THE U.S. PUBLIC
INTEREST RESEARCH GROUP, AND THE
CENTER FOR RESPONSIBLE LENDING
IN SUPPORT OF RESPONDENTS**

IRA RHEINGOLD
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
CONSUMER ADVOCATES
1730 Rhode Island Ave., NW,
Suite 805
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 452-1989

September 23, 2005

AMANDA QUESTER
Counsel of Record
JAMIE Z. GOODSON
JABRINA ROBINSON
CENTER FOR RESPONSIBLE
LENDING
910 17th St., NW, Suite 500
Washington, DC 20006
(202) 349-1872

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES.....	iii
INTEREST OF <i>AMICI CURIAE</i>	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT.....	3
ARGUMENT.....	5
I. ARBITRATION COSTS WILL PREVENT MANY CONSUMERS FROM CHALLENG- ING ILLEGAL CONTRACTS IF THE PETITIONER PREVAILS.....	5
II. ARBITRATION IS NOT AN EFFICIENT WAY TO RESOLVE CLAIMS THAT CONTRACTS ARE ILLEGAL.....	11
III. ARBITRATION IS NOT A FAVORABLE FORUM FOR CONSUMERS TO CHAL- LENGE ILLEGAL CONTRACTS	13
A. The Rules that Govern Binding Mandatory Arbitration Are Skewed in Ways that Impede Consumer Challenges.....	13
B. The Ernst & Young Study Does Not Prove that Arbitration Results Favor Consumers ..	16
IV. POST-ARBITRATION JUDICIAL REVIEW AND PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT AU- THORITY DO NOT OBTAIN THE NEED FOR COURTS TO DETERMINE THE LEGALITY OF CONTRACTS BEFORE ARBITRATION.....	20
A. Vacating an Arbitral Decision Is Very Difficult Under Current Law	20

TABLE OF CONTENTS—Continued

	Page
B. Public Enforcement Authority Alone Will Not Ensure Effective Enforcement of Consumer Protection Laws.....	21
CONCLUSION	23

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES	Page
<i>AmChem Prods., Inc. v. Windsor</i> , 521 U.S. 591 (1997).....	10
<i>Am. Pipe & Const. Co. v. Utah</i> , 414 U.S. 538 (1974).....	11
<i>Brabham v. A.G. Edwards & Sons Inc.</i> , 376 F.3d 377 (5th Cir. 2004)	20
<i>Cole v. Burns Int'l Sec. Servs.</i> , 105 F.3d 1465 (D.C. Cir. 1997).....	15
<i>Deposit Guar. Nat'l Bank v. Roper</i> , 445 U.S. 326 (1980).....	10
<i>DiRussa v. Dean Witter Reynolds Inc.</i> , 121 F.3d 818 (2d. Cir. 1997)	20
<i>Duferco Int'l Steel Trading v. T. Klaveness Shipping A/S</i> , 333 F.3d 383 (2d Cir. 2003)	20, 21
<i>Equitable Life Leasing Corp. v. Abbick</i> , 757 P.2d 304 (Kan. 1988).....	22
<i>Green Tree Fin. Corp. v. Randolph</i> , 531 U.S. 79 (2000).....	10
<i>IDS Life Ins. Co. v. Royal Alliance Assocs., Inc.</i> , 266 F.3d 645 (7th Cir. 2001)	21
<i>IDS Life Ins. Co. v. SunAmerica Life Ins. Co.</i> , 136 F.3d 537 (7th Cir. 1998).....	12
<i>Klussman v. Cross-Country Bank</i> , No. 2001-026688, slip op. (Cal. Super. Ct. Oct. 28, 2004).....	16
<i>Little v. Auto Stiegler, Inc.</i> , 63 P.3d 979 (Cal.), cert. denied, 540 U.S. 818 (2003).....	15
<i>Mace v. Van Ru Credit Corp.</i> , 109 F.3d 338 (7th Cir. 1997).....	10
<i>Mercuro v. Superior Court</i> , 116 Cal. Rptr. 2d 671 (Ct. App. 2002).....	16
<i>Moncharsch v. Heily & Blase</i> , 832 P.2d 899 (Cal. 1992).....	21

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—Continued

	Page
<i>Montes v. Shearson Lehman Bros.</i> , 128 F.3d 1456 (11th Cir. 1997)	21
<i>Phillips v. Assocs. Home Equity Servs., Inc.</i> , 179 F. Supp. 2d 840 (N.D. Ill. 2001).....	7
<i>Postow v. OBA Fed. Sav. & Loan Ass'n</i> , 627 F.2d 1370 (D.C. Cir. 1980).....	22
<i>Presidential Leasing, Inc. v. Krout</i> , 896 So. 2d 938 (Fla. Dist. Ct. App. 2005).....	22
<i>Ting v. AT&T</i> , 182 F. Supp. 2d 902 (N.D. Ca. 2002), <i>aff'd in relevant part, rev'd in part</i> , 319 F.3d 1126 (9th Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 540 U.S. 811 (2003).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>United Steelworkers of Am. v. Enter. Wheel & Car Corp.</i> , 363 U.S. 593 (1960).....	12

STATUTES

9 U.S.C. § 7	13
9 U.S.C. § 9	13
9 U.S.C. § 10	20
15 U.S.C. § 1601 <i>et seq.</i>	22
28 U.S.C. § 1914	8
Cal. Civ. Proc. Code § 1281.96	16

OTHER AUTHORITIES

AAA, Administrative Fee Waivers and Pro Bono Arbitrators Services (2003), <i>available at</i> http://www.adr.org/sp.asp?id=22040	7, 9
AAA, Commercial Arbitration Rules and Mediation Procedures (2005), <i>available at</i> http://www.adr.org/sp.asp?id=22002	6, 12
AAA, Supplementary Procedures for Consumer-Related Disputes (2005), <i>available at</i> http://www.adr.org/sp.asp?id=22014	5, 6

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—Continued

	Page
Bingham, Lisa B., <i>Employment Arbitration: The Repeat Player Effect</i> , 1 Emp. Rts. & Emp. Pol'y J. 189 (1997)	15
Budnitz, Mark E., <i>Arbitration of Disputes Between Consumers and Financial Institutions: A Serious Threat to Consumer Protection</i> , 10 Ohio St. J. on Disp. Resol. 267 (1995)...	14
Budnitz, Mark E., <i>The High Cost of Mandatory Consumer Arbitration</i> , 67 Law & Contemp. Probs. 133 (2004)	9, 10, 14
California Dispute Resolution Institute, <i>Consumer and Employment Arbitration in California: A Review of Website Data Posted Pursuant to Section 1281.96 of the Code of Civil Procedure (2004)</i> , available at http://www.mediate.com/cdri/cdri_print_Aug_6.pdf	7, 10, 16
Ernst & Young LLP, <i>Outcomes of Arbitration: An Empirical Study of Consumer Lending Cases (2004)</i> , available at http://www.arbforum.com/media/EY_2005.pdf	17, 18, 19
Ernst, Keith, et al., <i>CRL, Quantifying the Economic Cost of Predatory Payday Lending (2003)</i> , available at http://www.responsiblelending.org/pdfs/PaydayStudy-Dec03.pdf	3
JAMS, <i>Policy on Consumer Arbitrations Pursuant to Pre-Dispute Clauses Minimum Standards of Procedural Fairness (2005)</i> , available at http://www.jamsadr.com/rules/consumer_min_std.asp	7

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—Continued

	Page
King, Uriah, et al., CRL, Race Matters: The Concentration of Payday Lenders in African-American Neighborhoods in North Carolina (2005), available at http://www.responsiblelending.org/pdfs/PaydayRace-Mar05.pdf	3
Mayer, Caroline E., <i>Win Some, Lose Rarely?: Arbitration Forum's Rulings Called One-Sided</i> , Wash. Post, Mar. 1, 2000.....	15, 16, 17
NAF, Code of Procedure (2005), available at http://www.arb-forum.com/programs/code_new/2005_code.pdf	9
NAF, Drafting Mediation and Arbitration Clauses: Practical Tips and Sample Language (2005), available at http://www.arb-forum.com/resources/white_papers/05clauses.pdf	14-15, 17
NAF, Fee Schedule (2005), available at http://www.arb-forum.com/programs/code_new/2005_fees.pdf	6, 8
Public Citizen, The Costs of Arbitration (2002), available at http://www.citizen.org/documents/ACF110A.PDF	8
Randall, Susan, <i>Judicial Attitudes Toward Arbitration and the Resurgence of Unconscionability</i> , 52 Buff. L. Rev. 185 (2004).....	13
Sternlight, Jean R., <i>Panacea or Corporate Tool?: Debunking the Supreme Court's Preference for Binding Arbitration</i> , 74 Wash. U. L.Q. 637 (1996).....	16
Thornberry, Owen T., & James T. Massey, <i>Trends in United States Telephone Coverage Across Time and Subgroups, in Telephone Survey Methodology</i> (Robert M. Groves et al. eds., Wiley & Sons 1988).....	19

